

# A Quick Guide to Identifying the different Bruckner Versions and Editions

By John F. Berky – October 1, 2022

The purpose of this essay is to help listeners to self-identify the different Bruckner versions and editions of his eleven symphonies. This will be done using some audio examples that can be accessed using the embedded hyperlinks. This is, by no means, an extensive list of differences. For that, one should refer to William Carragan's book, Anton Bruckner: Eleven Symphonies published by the Bruckner Society of America.

A caveat: Many conductors are known to mark up their scores and occasionally they will substitute elements of one edition into another.

**Symphony in F Minor:** There is only one version

## **Symphony No 1 in C Minor**

1866 Linz version: Distinct drum roll at the conclusion of the symphony

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B1\\_Roeder\\_Drum-roll.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B1_Roeder_Drum-roll.mp3)

1877 Linz Version (Nowak): A more flowing finale with drum roll accompanying the orchestra

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B1\\_Nowak\\_Drum-roll.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B1_Nowak_Drum-roll.mp3)

1877 Linz version: Straightforward build up to the coda.

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B1\\_Nowak\\_Finale.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B1_Nowak_Finale.mp3)

1890 Vienna version: Distinctively slower build up to the coda.

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B1\\_Broeche\\_Finale.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B1_Broeche_Finale.mp3)

**Symphony in D Minor "Die Nullte":** No large difference between Wöss and Nowak editions.

## **Symphony No. 2 in C Minor**

1872 version: Scherzo is played as the second movement

1877 version: Adagio is played as the second movement

Haas edition: First movement finale

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B2\\_Haas\\_Mvt-1\\_Finale.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B2_Haas_Mvt-1_Finale.mp3)

Nowak edition: First movement finale

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B2\\_1877\\_Nowak\\_Mvt-1\\_Finale.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B2_1877_Nowak_Mvt-1_Finale.mp3)

Carragan edition: First movement finale

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B2\\_1877\\_Carragan\\_Mvt-1\\_Finale.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B2_1877_Carragan_Mvt-1_Finale.mp3)

## **Symphony No 3 in D Minor**

1873 version: Scherzo - opening measures:

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3\\_1873\\_Scherzo\\_Open.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3_1873_Scherzo_Open.mp3)

1877 version: Scherzo - opening measures:

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3\\_1877\\_Scherzo\\_Open.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3_1877_Scherzo_Open.mp3)

1873 version: Passage in the first movement:

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3\\_1873\\_Mvt-1\\_After-Unison.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3_1873_Mvt-1_After-Unison.mp3)

1877 version: Passage in the first movement:

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3\\_1877\\_Mvt-1\\_After-Unison.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3_1877_Mvt-1_After-Unison.mp3)

1889 version: Passage in the first movement:

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3\\_1889\\_Mvt-1\\_After-Unison.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3_1889_Mvt-1_After-Unison.mp3)

Nowak (1873) edition, Oeser (1876) edition; Nowak (1889) edition: No Scherzo coda

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3\\_1876-Scherzo\\_no\\_coda.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3_1876-Scherzo_no_coda.mp3)

Nowak (1877) edition: Scherzo coda added

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3\\_1877-Scherzo\\_coda.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B3_1877-Scherzo_coda.mp3)

## **Symphony No 4 in E Flat Major “Romantic”**

1874 version: Original Scherzo

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4\\_1874\\_Mvt-3\\_Open.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4_1874_Mvt-3_Open.mp3)

1876 version: Removes the silences that precede and follow the horn signal each time

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4\\_1876\\_Mvt-3-Open.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4_1876_Mvt-3-Open.mp3)

1880 versions “Hunting Scherzo”:

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4\\_1880\\_Mvt-3-Open.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4_1880_Mvt-3-Open.mp3)

1888 version: A new transition from Scherzo into the Trio:

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4\\_1888\\_Mvt-3\\_Lead-in-to-Trio.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4_1888_Mvt-3_Lead-in-to-Trio.mp3)

1878 version: Includes “Volksfest” Finale

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4\\_Mvt-4\\_Volksfest.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4_Mvt-4_Volksfest.mp3)

Haas edition: No recall of the opening horn call at the end of the Finale coda

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4\\_Haas\\_Mvt-4-Finale.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4_Haas_Mvt-4-Finale.mp3)

Nowak edition: The opening horn call is recalled at the end of the Finale coda

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4\\_Nowak\\_Mvt-4\\_Finale.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B4_Nowak_Mvt-4_Finale.mp3)

**Symphony No. 5 in B-flat Major:** no discernable difference between Haas and Nowak editions

Schalk edition finale, which includes cymbals:

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B5\\_Schalk\\_Mvt-4\\_Finale.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B5_Schalk_Mvt-4_Finale.mp3)

Haas / Nowak finale

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B5\\_Nowak\\_Mvt-4-Finale.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B5_Nowak_Mvt-4-Finale.mp3)

**Symphony No. 6 in A Major**

Haas edition: Oboe in Adagio coda

Nowak edition: Clarinet in Adagio coda

**Symphony No. 7 in E Minor**

Gutmann edition: Horn pre-echo at repeat of opening theme (not found in other editions)

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B7\\_Gutmann\\_Mvt-1-Open.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B7_Gutmann_Mvt-1-Open.mp3)

Haas edition: Trombones play at five seconds into this passage

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B7\\_Mvt-1\\_Haas.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B7_Mvt-1_Haas.mp3)

Nowak edition: Trombones enter later

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B7\\_Mvt-1\\_Nowak.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B7_Mvt-1_Nowak.mp3)

Haas edition: No cymbal, triangle or timpani in the Adagio at the climax

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B7\\_Haas\\_Mvt-2-Climax.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B7_Haas_Mvt-2-Climax.mp3)

Nowak edition: Cymbals, triangle or timpani enter in the Adagio at the climax

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B7\\_Nowak\\_Mvt-2\\_Climax.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B7_Nowak_Mvt-2_Climax.mp3)

**Symphony No. 8 in C Minor**

1887 version: First movement ends fortissimo – 1890 version: First movement ends pianissimo.

1887 version: Different trio section in Scherzo

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B8\\_1887\\_Mvt-2\\_Trio.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B8_1887_Mvt-2_Trio.mp3)

1890 Version: Revised trio section in Scherzo

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B8\\_Haas\\_Mvt-2\\_Trio.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B8_Haas_Mvt-2_Trio.mp3)

Haas version: Passage added in Finale

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B8\\_Haas\\_Mvt-3\\_Adagio-insertion.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B8_Haas_Mvt-3_Adagio-insertion.mp3)

Nowak edition: Passage cut from Finale

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B8\\_Nowak\\_Mvt-3\\_Adagio-insertion-NOT.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B8_Nowak_Mvt-3_Adagio-insertion-NOT.mp3)

**Symphony No. 9 in D Minor** – No significant differences between Orel and Nowak editions

Loewe version: Catastrophe chord is slightly “tamed”

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B9\\_Loewe\\_Mvt-3\\_catastrophe.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B9_Loewe_Mvt-3_catastrophe.mp3)

Orel version:

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B9\\_Orig\\_Mvt-3\\_catastrophe.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B9_Orig_Mvt-3_catastrophe.mp3)

Cohrs edition: Drum beats added at measure 299

[https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B9\\_Cohrs\\_Mvt-1\\_mm.--299-301.mp3](https://www.abruckner.com/down/downloads/examples/B9_Cohrs_Mvt-1_mm.--299-301.mp3)