

Bruckner's Fifth Symphony <Original Concepts>

Edited by Takanobu Kawasaki

Bruckner completed the First Version of the Symphony No. 5 on May 16, 1876. He completed the Second Version on January 4, 1878. The only autograph (Mus.Hs.19.477) is in the Austrian National Library and has been compiled from two different manuscripts:

First Movement + Adagio (Group A)

Scherzo + Finale (Group B)

Group B has the dates belonging to Version 1 and Version 2 but Group A only has Version 2. In Group A and Group B, the pen that Bruckner used is different. The handwriting in Group A is thin while the handwriting of Group B is bold and powerful. Due to a different pen being used in Group B, it is possible to determine what belongs in Version 1 and Version 2. Most of the material in Group B before corrections thus belongs in Version 1. However, this is not possible in Group A, so the only movements wherein we can see Bruckner's first concepts are the Scherzo and Finale (Group B). Due to a different pen being used in Group B, it is often possible to determine what belongs in Version 1 and Version 2, but it is not always completely clear. Bruckner occasionally scratched out with a razor the one to be corrected and wrote over it. Moreover, he often revised a passage two or three times. Therefore, it is very difficult to be certain which version belongs to which written section.

I edited my Original Concepts with these guidelines: I only used Mus.Hs.19.477 and Mus.Hs.3162 in the Austrian National Library (ONB). I did not use other sources except those original materials listed above, but only quoted "viel" at Adagio bar 163 from Nowak's Revisionsbericht page 81. (Bruckner added it in the handwriting copy of Mus.Hs.36.693 in ONB. It appears in new Cohrs' Edition, too.) I used this because "viel" is the original conception of Bruckner, not a later one. I returned all shortened bars and expanded bars to their original form, and I restored those places retouched by Bruckner as much as possible. I deleted the bass tuba and adjusted other brass instruments suitably.

From this score, one part of Bruckner's original concepts can be examined. The major advantage of this score is to obtain the sound of the string instruments that Bruckner originally intended, as this was of major importance to the composer. Today's performances are dominated by the brass instruments. Adding a bass tuba to the Symphony No. 5 is similar to the practice of adding cymbals to the Symphony No. 7.

My edition has been presented as the closest adaptation of what Bruckner's Original Concepts of the Symphony No. 5 would be. Like some of Robert Haas' work, it is an amalgamated edition which uses more than one version to bring together a unified and musically pleasing edition. In my case, I have amalgamated two versions in an effort to keep this lost version alive. It brings to the listener segments of Bruckner's early work on the Symphony No. 5 that would otherwise never be heard.

Takanobu Kawasaki

August, 2009

Referencing the booklet of NAITO B5 CD:

1-2 page: my explanation

Outline of the last paragraph (page: 2, line: 21-28):

Haas faithfully reproduced the Autograph.

However, one point.

He disregarded the time signatures for change by Bruckner own in the Adagio.

In all cases, Bruckner returned to 4/4 not alla breve from 6/4(or lined 12/8)

With this, contradiction is caused.

Maybe, various discussions might exist about this contradiction.

Schalk solved these problems by uniting all rhythm to 4/4 and 6/4.

3-6 page: Directionality of performance of maestro Naito.

He achieved two points by this performance;

1. Performance method of period.
2. The tempo of alla breve in the Adagio.

The essay is the explanation of them.

The outline of this essay is published in the following TBJ!

Verso(7 page): 4 music examples for alla breve tempo of Adagio by Naito.

(example 1): At the beginning of Original Version<perhaps parentheses of (Sehr langsam) are unnecessary>

Alla breve= The baton is shaken twice in one bar.

(example 2): At the beginning of First Edition(Schalk) <Adagio is exact instead of (Sehr langsam)>
6/4= The baton is shaken 6 times in one bar.

(example 3): B section(bar 31-) is same tempo as alla breve.<There are no alla breve marks in all editions but everybody can read alla breve in Haas and Nowak>

(example 4): Bruckner's instruction at bar 163. German means ; It is necessary to perform the melody by the same rhythm sense as alla breve till then.
However, the tempo should be made slower.